Reference Guides to Rhetoric and Composition

Series Editor, Charles Bazerman

REFERENCE GUIDES TO RHETORIC AND COMPOSITION Series Editor, Charles Bazerman

The Series provides compact, comprehensive and convenient surveys of what has been learned through research and practice as composition has emerged as an academic discipline over the last half century. Each volume is devoted to a single topic that has been of interest in rhetoric and composition in recent years, to synthesize and make available the sum and parts of what has been learned on that topic. These reference guides are designed to help deepen classroom practice by making available the collective wisdom of the field and will provide the basis for new research. The Series is intended to be of use to teachers at all levels of education, researchers and scholars of writing, graduate students learning about the field, and all who have interest in or responsibility for writing programs and the teaching of writing.

Parlor Press and The WAC Clearinghouse are collaborating so that these books will be widely available through low-cost print editions and free digital distribution. The publishers and the Series editor are teachers and researchers of writing, committed to the principle that knowledge should freely circulate. We see the opportunities that new technologies have for further democratizing knowledge. And we see that to share the power of writing is to share the means for all to articulate their needs, interest, and learning into the great experiment of literacy.

Existing Books in the Series

Invention in Rhetoric and Composition (2004, Lauer)
Reference Guide to Writing across the Curriculum (2005, Bazerman, Little, Bethel, Chavkin, Fouquette, and Garufis)
Revision: History, Theory, and Practice (2006, Horning and Becker)
Writing Program Administration (2007, McLeod)
Community Literacy and the Rhetoric of Local Publics (2008, Long)
Argument in Composition (2009, Ramage, Callaway, Clary-Lemon, and Waggoner)

Argument in Composition

John Ramage, Micheal Callaway, Jennifer Clary-Lemon, and Zachary Waggoner

Parlor Press West Lafayette, Indiana www.parlorpress.com

The WAC Clearinghouse http://wac.colostate.edu/

Parlor Press LLC, West Lafayette, Indiana 47906

© 2009 by Parlor Press and The WAC Clearinghouse All rights reserved.

- John Leo's "Turning a Blind Eye to Evil," 12 October 2001, U.S. News and World Report. © 2001, U.S. News and World Report, L.P. Reprinted with permission.
- Stanley Fish's "Condemnation without Absolutes," 15 October 2001, The New York Times. © 2001, The New York Times Company. Reprinted with permission.

Printed in the United States of America

SAN: 254-8879

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Argument in composition / John Ramage ... [et al.].

p. cm. -- (Reference guides to rhetoric and composition)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-60235-109-7 (pbk. : alk. paper) -- ISBN 978-1-60235-110-3 (hard-cover : alk. paper) -- ISBN 978-1-60235-111-0 (adobe ebook)

1. English language--Rhetoric--Study and teaching (Higher) 2. Persuasion (Rhetoric)--Study and teaching (Higher) 3. Report writing--Study and teaching (Higher) I. Ramage, John D.

PE1431.A77 2009 808'.0420711--dc22

2009032671

Series logo designed by Karl Stolley. Copyediting by Ethan Sproat. This book is printed on acid-free paper.

Parlor Press, LLC is an independent publisher of scholarly and trade titles in print and multimedia formats. This book is available in paperback, cloth, and Adobe eBook formats from Parlor Press on the World Wide Web at http://www.parlorpress.com. For submission information or to find out about Parlor Press publications, write to Parlor Press, 816 Robinson St., West Lafayette, Indiana, 47906, or e-mail editor@ parlorpress.com.

The WAC Clearinghouse supports teachers of writing across the disciplines. Hosted by Colorado State University's Composition Program, it brings together four journals, three book series, and resources for teachers who use writing in their courses. This book will also be available free on the Internet at The WAC Clearinghouse (http://wac.colostate.edu/).

Contents

Reference Guides to Rhetoric and Composition i Series Editor's Preface ix Preface xi
 ¹ Introduction: Why Argument Matters 3 Coming to an Understanding of Argument 5 John Leo, "Cultural Relativism Leaves Some Blind to Evil" (2001, Universal Press Syndicate), 10/15/01 7 Stanley Fish, "Condemnation without Absolutes" 9 Discussion of Leo and Fish Part I: Some Theoretical Background 11 Discussion of Leo and Fish Part II: Getting from Duality to Commitment 15 Leo and Fish Part III: The Elements of Argument 17 Argument and "the purification of war" 25 Why students Need Argument 30 Argument and Critical Literacy 31 Argument and Identity 35 Ethics and Argument 40
Notes482 The History of Argument49Philosophy vs Rhetoric50Rhetoric's Ossification Problem62Key Figures of Modern Argument Theory67Introduction to Kenneth Burke67Introduction to Chaim Perelman andLucie Olbrechts-TytecaLucie Olbrechts-Tyteca73Stephen Toulmin86Summary94Notes97

v

3 Issues in Argument 98 The Fallacy Debate 98 The Pragma-Dialectical Approach to Fallacies 103 Alternatives to Focusing on Argument in a Writing Class: Critical/Cultural Studies 106 Expressivist Pedagogy 109 Procedural Rhetoric 118 To Teach or Not to Teach . . . Propaganda 122 What Is Propaganda? Burke and Ellul 123 Propaganda in a Nutshell 136 Notes 139 4 Introduction to Best Practices 140 What Works in Teaching Writing 140 **Best Practices** 143 Liberatory Rhetoric 146 Works Cited 151 For Further Reading 152 Argument Textbooks 152 Scholarly Works 152 Feminism and Argument 157 Works Cited 161 For Further Reading 162 Argument Textbooks 162 Scholarly Works 163 Service Learning and Argument 166 Works Cited 169 For Further Reading 170 Argument Textbooks 170 Scholarly Works 170 Writing Across the Curriculum (WAC) and Writing in the Disciplines (WID) 174 Works Cited 177 For Further Reading 177 Argument Textbooks 177 Scholarly Works—General 178 178 Anthropology Business 179 Economics 181 182 Engineering Political Science 182

Computers and Writing 183 Works Cited 186 For Further Reading 188 Textbooks 188 Scholarly Works 189 Visual Rhetoric 191 Works Cited 195 For Further Reading 196 196 Textbooks Scholarly Works 197 5 Glossary of Terms 199 6 Annotated Bibliography 213 Works Cited 247 Index 251 About the Authors 257