

WHAT WE REALLY VALUE

WHAT WE REALLY VALUE
*Beyond Rubrics in Teaching
and Assessing Writing*

BOB BROAD

UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY PRESS
Logan, Utah

Utah State University Press
Logan, Utah 84322-7800

© 2003 Utah State University Press
All rights reserved.

Manufactured in the United States of America
Cover design by Barbara Yale-Read
Cover illustration “World Map” by Pietro Vesconte (c. 1321), courtesy of
the British Library Board, London.
“Vinland Map” (c. 1440) in Prologue, courtesy of Yale University Library, New Haven.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Broad, Bob, 1960-

What we really value : beyond rubrics in teaching and assessing
writing / Bob Broad.
p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

ISBN 0-87421-553-6 (pbk. : alk. paper) **ISBN 0-87421-480-7 (e-book)**

1. English language—Rhetoric—Study and teaching. 2. Report
writing—Study and teaching (Higher) 3. English language—Ability
testing. 4. Grading and marking (Students) 5. Report
writing—Evaluation. I. Title.

PE1404 .B738 2003

808'.042'0711—dc21

2002153374

for
JULIE SUZANNE HILE
my finest friend, partner, and teacher

and for
DYLAN AND RACHEL
who make everything so much more worthwhile

in memory of
MAURICE SCHARTON
teacher, colleague, writing assessment dude

CONTENTS

<i>List of Figures</i>	<i>viii</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>viii</i>
<i>Prologue</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xiii</i>
1 To Tell the Truth: Beyond Rubrics	1
2 Studying Rubric-Free Assessment at City University: Research Context and Methods	16
3 Textual Criteria: What They Really Valued, Part 1	32
4 Contextual Criteria: What They Really Valued, Part 2	73
5 A Model for Dynamic Criteria Mapping of Communal Writing Assessment	119
<i>Appendix A: Assignments for English 1 Essays</i>	<i>139</i>
<i>Appendix B: Selected Sample Texts from City University</i>	<i>142</i>
<i>Midterm essays</i>	<i>142</i>
“Anguish”	142
“Gamma Sally”	144
“Pops”	146
<i>End-term portfolios</i>	<i>148</i>
Portfolio 2	148
“Professional Helper” (from Portfolio 3)	156
Portfolio 4	157
<i>Appendix C: Tabulation of Votes on Sample Texts</i>	<i>165</i>
<i>Appendix D: Sample Interview Questions</i>	<i>166</i>
<i>Appendix E: Explanation of References to City University Transcripts</i>	<i>167</i>
<i>References</i>	<i>169</i>
<i>Index</i>	<i>173</i>

LIST OF FIGURES

1	Structure of the Portfolio Program at City University	19
2	Overview of Dynamic Criteria Mapping for City University	33
3	Dynamic Criteria Mapping for City University's Textual Qualities	39
	Dynamic Criteria Map (large format)	<i>(back cover pocket)</i>
4	The Epistemic Spectrum	41
5	Change in Student Author	43
6	Empty, Hollow, Clichéd	49
7	Aesthetic Constellation	51
8	Agency/Power Constellation	52
9	Ethos Constellation	56
10	Part-to-Whole Constellation	58

LIST OF TABLES

1	Chronology of Key Communal Events in City University's Portfolio Program	22
2	Quantitative Analysis of All Criteria for Judgment	34
3	City University's Textual Features	62
4	City University's Contextual Criteria	74