Moving beyond integrity: Accommodating disciplinary, cultural, linguistic and modal differences in the policy and pedagogy of plagiarism

Cary DiPietro Faculty & Curriculum Development Centre OCAD University



Why move beyond integrity?

integrity (noun) 1. The quality of being honest and having strong moral principles (*Oxford Dictionaries*. Web. 15 June 2015).

"[...] academic integrity [is] a commitment, even in the face of adversity, to six fundamental values: **honesty, trust, fairness, respect, responsibility, and courage.** From these values flow principles of behavior that enable academic communities to translate ideals to action." (*International Centre for Academic Integrity*. Web. 15 June 2015).



Why move beyond integrity?

integrity (noun) 2. The state of being whole and undivided (*Oxford Dictionaries*. Web. 15 June 2015).

"[...] our intellectual community embraces all who have contributed to the sum of human knowledge [...] The ethic of intellectual honesty goes hand in hand with the University's efforts to advance and disseminate knowledge by drawing fairly on the ideas of others, by presenting and testing ideas, and by giving and receiving appropriate recognition" ("Academic Integrity at the University of Toronto." University of Toronto. Web. 15 June 2015, bold added).



Is this visual plagiarism?



Left: Jeff Koons' *Balloon Dog*, photographed at the opening of the Broad Contemporary Art Museum, Los Angeles, 7 Feb 2008. Image via *The Independent*. Right: *Bookends* by Park Life, n.d. Web. 29 June 2014.



Is this visual plagiarism?



Left: Art Rogers. *Puppies*.1985. Offset lithograph on coated paper. Web. 29 June 2014. Right: Jeff Koons. *String of Puppies*, 1988. Private collection.



What is a visual concept?







Originality and derivation



Left: Cat Bluemke, *Pietra Serena*. Florence, Italy. April, 2015.



Originality and derivation



Left: Photograph of ball-jointed doll made by by Leeke World, Japan. N.d. Right: An illustration that plagiarizes the visual concept of the doll, by Mijn Schatje, no title, n.d. Web. 29 June 2014.



Copyright, permission and fair use



Above left: Promotional posters for "Family Guy: Blue Harvest." Fuzzy Door Productions and 20th Century Fox Television, 2007. Web. 29 June 2014. Above right: *Star Wars: Episode IV A New Hope* (Two-Disc Widescreen Enhanced and Original Theatrical Versions). 20th Century Fox Video, 2006. DVD cover. Web. 29 June 2014.



Teaching students about using visual sources



Above: Cristina Gapic. Untitled photograph of Faculty of Art critique. OCAD University, 2012.



Documenting visual research



Left: Amiria Robinson and Heather Garland. "International GCSE Art Skecthbook Examples" *Student Art Guide*. Web, 2002. 29 June 2014. Right: Jason Week. "An Annotated Sketchbook Page." *Billy the Dunce*. Web, 2011. 29 June 2014.



Citing visual research



Above: Cristina Gapic. Untitled photograph of studio course. OCAD University, 2012.

OCAD UNIVERSITY



Academic integrity learning modules

- question-driven tutorials
- clear learning outcomes
- definitions of key concepts
- pre- and post-tests
- links to strategies for source use and resources



Using Visual Sources: case study 2, the problem

If nobody knows what I'm borrowing from, does it matter?

Hiro grew up watching the films of his film-buff parents. One of his favourite films is a relatively obscure Japanese science fiction film from 1956 called *Warning from Space*. He especially loves the kitsch costumes of the starfish aliens that were scary for him when he was young but now strike him as comical. In particular, Hiro remembers the very artificial eye worn over the belly of the actors whose own eyes are covered in cloth. He decides he wants to use a similar visual concept for a drawing project for a third-year studio course to comment on the difference between childhood versus adult perspective.

The drawing that Hiro produces is based on a still image of the film he found online, though he changes it by making the aliens softer and rounder. He decides that since the film is so obscure, he doesn't need to mention his visual source because no one will recognize it. He also believes he's making an illustration using his own original style.

Do you think Hiro's appropriation of the image is fair or reasonable?



Left: Koji Shima (director). Warning from Space. Japan: Daiei Studios, 1956. Right: Cat Bluemke. Untitled. January 4, 2016.



References

- College Art Association. (2015). Code of best practices in fair use for the visual arts. College Art Association.
- Council of Writing Program Administrators. (2003). Defining and avoiding plagiarism: The WPA statement on best practices.
- Gallant, T. B. & Drinan, P. (2008). Toward a model of academic integrity institutionalization: Informing practice in postsecondary education. *Canadian journal of higher education*, 38.2, 25-43.
- Hughes, J. M. C. & McCabe, D. L. (2006). Academic misconduct in higher education in Canada. *Canadian journal of higher education*, 36.2, 1-21.
- Meizlish, D. (2005). Promoting academic integrity in the classroom. *CRLT occasional papers*. Centre for Research on Teaching and Learning, University of Michigan.
- Roberts, H. (2006). Maintaining academic integrity & avoiding visual plagiarism in assessment in the visual arts. University of East London.



From visual to textual plagiarism

- acknowledge complexity of issues in highly derivative culture
- address and teach to specificity of disciplinary and professional context
- recognize the range of ways to document and cite sources



- address variety of sources students engage with (textual, visual, audio, digital, e.g., code, material sources) and acknowledge differences between them
- recognize that learning how to create knowledge involves imitation, copying ("sounding like" the discipline)
- teach students how to develop personal voice through creativity, narrative, originality and appropriation



Linguistic and cultural differences

- recognize that academic documentation and citation practices are also historically and culturally specific
- allow that they require skills that will take all students time to acquire
- shift focus from citation style to why we cite sources



Statement on Academic Integrity

"OCAD University recognizes that the pursuits of knowledge and creativity are iterative and collaborative, and that academic and creative work involves building upon, responding to and interacting with the contributions of others. **All members of the university**, including faculty, students and staff, therefore **share an equal responsibility to recognize and uphold the principles of academic integrity**."



Statement on Academic Integrity

"Faculty and staff have a responsibility to develop pedagogy and resources at all levels to support students in their development of knowledge, skills and attitudes consistent with academic integrity."



Academic Misconduct Policy

"OCAD University recognizes that students may make unintentional mistakes in the process of learning the culturally and contextually specific practices of their disciplines and professions [...] The procedures for implementation of the policy described below include provisions for determining what a student at any given level should reasonably be expected to know and be able to demonstrate with respect to academic conduct, irrespective of intentionality."